On Media Development: An unorthodox empirical view

Daniel Kaufmann, The Brookings Institution

Presentation at event on Media Development at the Center for International Media Assistance (CIMA) at the National Endowment for Democracy (NED), with Internews

Washington, D.C., January 30th, 2012

Note: This presentation excerpts the review paper by the author on this topic which is being finalized. The data presented here ought to be interpreted with caution, as it is subject to some margins of error (such as on governance and media freedom/sustainability) as well as some gaps and coding challenges (such as the OECD-DAC aid data). The paper presents these issues in further detail. The advise of M. Nelson and T. Susman-Pena and assistance of V. Penciakova and W. Daniel is acknowledged. Views and errors are the author’s.
On Media Development:
An unorthodox empirical view

• **What** (is Media Development)?

• Does it **Matter**?

• **Who** Does it & how **Much**?

• **For Whom**, and **How Well Done** (or not)?

• Some **Lessons**?
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Publication</th>
<th>Definition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>African Media Development Initiative</td>
<td>“Research Summary Report,” 2011, <a href="#">Link</a></td>
<td>Media development is…the development of private, community, public and/or state media that are both independent and pluralistic.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Banda, Fackson</td>
<td>“The Politics of Media Development,” ThoughtLeader, February 2008, <a href="#">Link</a></td>
<td>&quot;[Media Development] is being viewed as the totality of all support mechanisms for the growth of media institutions into vibrant agents of social and political change in democratic and undemocratic polities.&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Center for International Media Assistance</td>
<td>Cima.ned.org, Website, December 2011, <a href="#">Link</a></td>
<td>&quot;Media development' generally refers to efforts by organizations, people, and sometimes governments to develop the capacity and quality of the media sector within a specific country or region.&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coyne, Christopher, and Peter Leeson</td>
<td>“Read all About It! Understanding the Role of Media in Economic Development,” Kyklos, 2005, <a href="#">Link</a></td>
<td>The creation of an institution that facilitates democracy and economic development by correcting information asymmetries.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Global Forum for Media Development</td>
<td>“Statues as Adopted by Steering Committee on September 2008,” GMFD Constitution, September 2008, <a href="#">Link</a></td>
<td>&quot;Media development includes actions in support of system of media regulation conducive to freedom of expression, pluralism and diversity, strengthening media capacity to inform; plurality and diversity of media, transparency…, respect for journalism that represents professional independence and diversity of views and interests, supporting institutions that underpin media freedom...&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Governance and Social Resource Center</td>
<td>Gsdrc.org, Website, December 2011, <a href="#">Link</a></td>
<td>&quot;Media development aims to create a media sector that is both independent and pluralistic.&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Author</td>
<td>Publication</td>
<td>Definition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>African Media Development Initiative</td>
<td>“Research Summary Report,” 2011, <a href="#">Link</a></td>
<td>Media development is…the development of private, community, public and/or state media that are both independent and pluralistic.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International Commission for the Study of Communication Problems *</td>
<td>“Many Voices, One World,” UNESCO, 1980</td>
<td>The development of “comprehensive national policies” linked to overall social, cultural, and economic development in accordance with national needs and traditions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roy, Sanjukta</td>
<td>“Overview Report: Measuring Media Development,” Internews, Media Map Document, March 2011,</td>
<td>&quot;Media Development for current purposes is the process of improving both the media's ability to communicate with the public, and the public ability to inform itself and communicate, using media.&quot;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sida (Ljungman, Ponning, Sigh, Pedersen, et al)</td>
<td>“Sida’s Work with Culture and Media,” Sida Evaluation 04/38, October 2004, <a href="#">Link</a></td>
<td>Media development is…the development of civil rights and political participation in the recipient country and to facilitate diversity of cultural expression.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNESCO</td>
<td>“Media Development Indicators,” MDI, December 2011, <a href="#">Link</a></td>
<td>&quot;…media ecology to be constructed in order to ensure freedom of expression, pluralism and diversity of the media.&quot;</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Media Development: Focus & Definition

• Media development should place ‘freedom’ center stage
• From A. Sen’s ‘development as freedom’ to ‘media development as media freedom’…
• Media Freedom alone may not be sufficient condition but is necessary condition for successful media development
• Complementing media freedom: financial, infrastructure and professional capacity factors for media development
• A definition of Media Development that places Media Freedom at the center, recognizing other components: Empowering a multitude of media institutions and actors to operate independently and professionally, without undue constraints by the state or elites, promoting freedom of expression and democratic accountability.
Where have Media Freedoms in the real world gone?
Freedom House, Electoral Democracies: 1990-2010

Source: 2011 Freedom House. Line chart measures percentage of countries considered to be democracies and not democracies.
Freedom of the Press, 1994 and 2010: Developing Countries

% countries in 1994

34.6% Not Free
26.5% Part Free
38.9% Free

% countries in 2010

39.0% Part Free
39.7% Free
21.3% Not Free

Source: 2010 Freedom House. Pie Chart measures percentage of countries in the region with free press (rating of 30 or below), partly free (ratings between 30 and 60) and not free (rating above 60). Sample consists of 165 non-OECD countries.
Freedom of the Press: Selected Countries with Increasing Media Repression (Freedom House, 1996-2010)

Source: 2011 Freedom House. Line chart measures the Freedom of the Press in select countries. The original index is from 0 (best) – 100 (worst). For the purposes of this graph it has been reversed, the range is from 0 (worst) to 100 (best).
Freedom of the Press: Selected Countries with Reversals (Freedom House, 1996-2010)

Source: 2011 Freedom House. Line chart measures the Freedom of the Press in select countries. The original index is from 0 (best) – 100 (worst). For the purposes of this graph it has been reversed, the range is from 0 (worst) to 100 (best).
Does Media Development Matter?

• Yes, overall it does, when done smartly
• Substantive empirical research literature showing that Media Freedom is associated with corruption control, higher incomes and investments, and political stability.
• Media development initiatives associated with improved public service delivery
• Important complementarities that need to be taken into account (and interactive effects, e.g. w. RoL)
• Interpretation of each study with some caution – data & methodological challenges
• But overall: Preponderance of Evidence
Freedom of the Press is Associated with Corruption Control

(Emerging Economy sample -- 135 countries)

Effect of Media Freedom on Control of Corruption

(when Low Rule of Law)

Effect of Rule of Law on Control of Corruption

(when Low Press Freedom)

Effect of Media Freedom and Rule of Law on Control of Corruption

Patterns of Financial Aid to Media Development: Initial Review

• Caveats and interpretative caution applies in particular in this section, given some gaps, coding issues and potential inaccuracies in the OECD-DAC aid database.
Media Development Assistance Compared to Remainder of ODA, 2002-2009

Source: OECD DAC Creditor Reporting System (last updated in April 2011). Disbursements by donor include all bilateral, regional and bilateral unspecified aid for media development. Media development includes aid for media and free flow of information; ICT, Telecommunications, radio/TV/print media and Communications policy and administrative management.
Composition of Media Development Assistance, 2007-2009

Source: OECD DAC Creditor Reporting System (last updated in April 2011). Each slice represents the share of the total annualized average for each type of media development assistance.
Composition of Media Development Assistance, 2002-2009

Source: OECD DAC Creditor Reporting System (last updated in April 2011).
Media Development Assistance: Bilateral and Multilateral Disbursements, 2002-2009

Source: OECD DAC Creditor Reporting System (last updated in April 2011). Disbursements by donor include all bilateral, regional and bilateral unspecified aid for media development.
Media Development Assistance: Bilateral and Multilateral Disbursements, 2002-2009

Source: OECD DAC Creditor Reporting System (last updated in April 2011). Disbursements by donor include all bilateral, regional and bilateral unspecified aid for media development. Each point represents a three-year moving average for media development assistance.
Average per Country (within each group) Annual Aid to Media Development, by Level of FH Press Freedom

Share of Group Aid to Media Development, by Level of FH Press Freedom

- Free: 55.8%
- Partly Free: 41.6%
- Not Free: 2.6%

Source: OECD DAC Creditor Reporting System (last updated in April 2011) & Freedom House, Freedom of the Press, 2010 edition. The number of countries in the free group are 15; the number in the partly free group are 54 and the number in the not free group are 57.
Average per Country (within each group) Annual Aid to Media Development, by Change in FH Press Freedom

Share of Group Aid to Media Development, by Change in FH Press Freedom

![Pie chart showing distribution of aid by change in press freedom](chart_image.png)

- **Improving PF:** 25.4%
- **Little Change PF:** 13.7%
- **Deteriorating PF:** 60.9%

Source: OECD DAC Creditor Reporting System (last updated in April 2011) & Freedom House, Freedom of the Press, 2010 edition. The number of countries in the deteriorating group are 24; in the little change group are 86 and in the improving group are 16.
Concluding: Some Implications for Discussion

1. **Media Development as Media Freedom**, with some additions. *Media Freedom as a necessary condition, even if not sufficient*

2. Media Freedom embattled: focus on policy, legal, regulations

3. Media Freedom & Media Development: They do **Matter** – with caution, smarts, selectivity & complementarities

4. Beyond State-owned: **Capture** as threat from media privates

5. Data, Monitoring & Evaluation: **Sobering** picture

6. Media Development Aid: **compositional shift**: decline in aid from key donors. And insufficient selectivity. [*But data issues*]

7. Traditional training vs. need for **Innovative** approaches

8. The **Subsidy** conundrum: *Targeted Financial vs. ‘Infrastructure’*